
EDUCATION AND TRAINING STRATEGY FOR THE CIVIL STATE

Muhammad Taufik¹, Didin Wahidin², Waska Warta³, R. Supyan Sauri⁴

¹ Doctoral Student of Postgraduate Science Education School, Islamic Nusantara University

²³⁴ Postgraduate Science Education School, Islamic Nusantara University

Abstract

Education and leadership training aims to improve the leadership quality of a state civil apparatus in the implementation of government organizations. This education and training is conducted in stages from the center to the regions with different achievements. This study uses qualitative approach with the case study method. The data collection techniques use observation, in-depth interviews and documentation with an interactive stage process in data analysis. The results showed that the education strategy and leadership training level III in improving the quality of the performance of the state civil apparatus of the North Hulu Sungai Regency Government implemented by the Regional Human Resources Development Agency of South Kalimantan Province has been implemented based on various applicable regulations, but there is still a discrepancy between the expected objectives of education and leadership training level III with the follow-up placement of both promotion and career improvement of the country's civil apparatus.

Keywords: strategy, education and training, state civil apparatus

1. Introduction

The opening of the Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia in 1945, it is necessary to build a state civil apparatus that has integrity, professional, neutral and free from political intervention, clean from the practice of corruption, collusion, and nepotism, and able to provide public services for the community and able to carry out the role as an adhesive element of national unity and unity based on Pancasila and the Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia year 1945.

The government strives to improve the quality of government services both at the central and regional levels through improving the leadership quality of the state civil apparatus by organizing education and leadership training level II, III, IV.

The implementation of improving the quality of the performance of the state civil apparatus is based on the comparison between competencies and qualifications required by the position with the competencies and qualifications that candidates have in recruitment, appointment, placement, and promotion of positions in line with good governance.

Leadership education and training activities are representations of various resources responsible for improving the quality of human resources. Education and training are expected to have directions and policies that will support the success of institutions that become a basic group in human resource development. Where the development of apparatus resources through periodic education and training programs, carried out in accordance with their fields. This condition is

carried out in order to provide support and improvement of the performance of the institution's organization.

The strategic thing of the management of state civil apparatus resources related to education and training is that education and training become one of the rewards and requirements in the appointment of positions, including promotion, granting benefits and sanctions, mutations, and promotions through the results of assessment of the performance of state civil apparatus guaranteed objectivity in the development of state civil apparatus.

The Human Resources Development Agency of South Kalimantan Province is an accredited government institution in South Kalimantan authorized to conduct level III education and training for the state civil apparatus of the Local Government in Law No. 23 of 2014 on Local Government. The authority is obtained through accreditation by the State Administrative Agency of the Republic of Indonesia in accordance with the State Civil Apparatus Law and government regulations on the management of state civil apparatus overshadowing all competency development for state civil apparatus in the province of South Kalimantan.

The implementation of education and training of state civil apparatus based on Government Regulation No. 11 of 2017 concerning Civil Servant Management requires that every administrative official must have managerial competence at each level of office through Education and leadership training level IV for supervisory level (echelon IV), Education and leadership training level III for administrator level (echelon III), Education and leadership training level II for primary and Education high leadership position levels and leadership training level I for the level of high leadership positions and the position of the main high leader.

This article discusses some of the main findings of a Critical Discourse Analysis of two landmark documents in Irish adult education: Learning for Life: The White Paper on Adult Education (DES, 2000) and the Further Education and Training Strategy (SOLAS, 2014) (from here on referred to respectively as the White Paper and the FET Strategy). The diachronic approach taken by this inquiry permits an exploration of the ways in which language in policy documents has changed over time, particularly in terms of how policy addresses educational inequality. It is in this way that the notion of a discursive shift could be explored, setting this change in language in starker relief (Shannon, 2019).

This study concluded that from the results of the SWOT analysis, four alternative strategies were formulated, the strategies of Strength-Opportunities, Weaknesses-Opportunities, Strength-Threats, and Weaknesses-Threats which included quality improvement from 3 principles Software, Hardware and Brain ware. From the above conditions, the strategy for implementing education and training at the Palembang Aviation Training and Education Center will be well implemented (Septiani & Cahyono, 2019).

2. Method

The method used in this study is qualitative descriptive research method because researchers want to describe or describe the facts or circumstances or symptoms that appear in the education strategy and training of the state civil apparatus in the Government of North Hulu Sungai

Regency held at the Human Resources Development Agency of South Kalimantan Province. Qualitative descriptive research is research that describes or depicts research objects based on visible facts or as they are. Nawawi and Martini (1996) called qualitative descriptive research trying to describe all the symptoms or conditions that exist, namely the state of symptoms, according to what they are at the time of the study.

Qualitative descriptive research is used based on considerations: 1) Adjusting qualitative methods are easier when dealing with reality, 2) This method presents directly the relationship between researchers and respondents, and, 3) This method is more sensitive and more able to adjust to the many sharpening of shared influences and to the patterns of values faced (Moleong, 2017).

The determination of informants in this study is based on the criteria: a) full acculturation, meaning that the subject is long enough or at least better known, so that it has special knowledge or information or is close to the situation that is the focus of the study, b) direct involvement, subjects who are still active in the activity environment that is the target of the study, c) subjects who still have time to be asked for information by researchers, d) subjects have the authority and capacity to provide information, e) subjects who do not package information, but provide actual information (Mulyana, 2006).

Qualitative data collection techniques, namely; interviews, observations, documentation, and focused discussions. In this approach, researchers created a complex picture, examined words, detailed reports of respondents' views, and conducted studies on natural situations (Creswell, 1998). Data collection is conducted under natural conditions, primary data sources and more data collection techniques on participant observations, in-depth interviews and documentation.

In data analysis, the researchers create field records, select data that is important to support arguments in research reports, and look at the relationships between the data that have been collected. There are 4 analytical models in qualitative research. The four analysis models are data collection, data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing (Miles and Huberman, 1984).

3. Results

One of the main prerequisites to support success in achieving these goals is the availability of skilled, expert, capable and competent and capable human resources. The support of personnel resources of the North Hulu Sungai Regency Staffing and Training Education Agency based on the circumstances of December 31, 2019 as many as 38 people, consisting of 27 male civil servants and 11 female civil servants plus 5 volunteer workers.

In general, the condition of the state civil apparatus of the Agency Personnel and Training Education Of North Hulu Sungai Regency has a fairly good educational competence judging by the composition of the number of employees with a Master's education level of 4 people; Bachelor's degree as many as 20 people; 5 Persons Diploma; Upper Secondary School equals 4 people; First Level Lalinjutan School equals 2 People; and Elementary School as many as 2 people.

Then the number of civil apparatus of the state Agency Personnel and Training Education North Hulu Sungai Regency, as follows, namely:

Table 1. Number of State Civil Apparatus by Rank and Class

No	Work Unit	Class Level / Rank																Amount
		I/a	I/b	I/c	I/d	II/a	II/b	II/c	II/d	III/a	III/b	III/c	III/d	IV/a	IV/b	IV/c	IV/d	
1.	Head of Agency														1			1
2.	Secretary														1			1
3.	Head of Field													3				3
4.	Subsections/fields										3	3						6
5.	Staff / Executors										1		1					2
6.	Staffing Analysts									1	1							2
7.	Financial Report Manager											1						1
8.	Financial Verifikator								3									3
9.	Computer Links								2	1								3
10.	Archivist							1										1
11.	Electronics Technicians									1								1
12.	Caraka		2		1	1												4
13.	General administration					1	1		1	1	1	1						6
14.	Computer Operators						1											1
15.	Population Analyst									1								1
16.	Domestic Political Analyst									2								2
Amount			2	0	1	2	1	2	6	7	3	5	4	3	2	0		38

Data source: SIMPEG 2019 application

In accordance with its main duties and functions, the Agency for Personnel, Education and Training of North Hulu Sungai Regency assists staffing supervisors in the management of staffing management, starting from planning, recruitment, coaching up to the dismissal of state civil apparatus. Related to this, and increasing public awareness about democracy, human rights, justice, and demands of the role of each member of the community or development stakeholders demand the implementation of government, community activities, and development that is increasingly professional. It is expected to produce strengthening government institutions that can produce better services.

In addition to the demands of roles and services, the demand for equality of roles between men and women in development is also increasing. Even in various programs developed, gender

perspective becomes one of the conditions both in implementation and in the goal of change of a development program that is proclaimed.

One of the basics used in the management of staffing management is Government Regulation No. 9 of 2003 concerning the Authority of Appointment, Transfer, and Dismissal of Civil Servants followed up by the Decree of the Head of the State Personnel Agency No. 13 of 2003, Dated April 21, 2003 concerning Technical Guidelines for the Implementation of Government Regulation No. 9 of 2003 concerning The Authority for The Appointment of Transfers, and Dismissal of Civil Servants. The scope of such services includes:

- a. Determination of the promotion of Civil Servants of North Hulu Sungai Regency to become a Level my Young Interpreters of room class I /b up to Tk. I stylist of room III/d by the Regent;
- b. The Governor stipulates the promotion of District/Municipal Civil Servants, Civil Servants who are assisting in the District/ City Government to become The Supervisor of room IV/a and Level I Supervisor of room IV/b;
- c. Related to the authority, the number of employees in the North Hulu Sungai Regency Government until December 31, 2018 is as many as 4,943 employees consisting of 2,366 male employees and 2,577 female employees.

4. Discussion

Regulation of the Head of State Administrative Agency No. 19 of 2015 has packaged education and training programs that can equip and test the leadership skills of apparatus through learning stages and materials that are able to support participants to become strategic leaders of change. In accordance with the mandate of this regulation, education, learning and leadership training level III will go through five (5) stages, namely: 1) stage of diagnosis of change needs; 2) the stage of building a joint commitment; 3) the stage of designing changes and building a team; 4) leadership laboratory stage; and 5) evaluation stage. Each of these stages has a special purpose in equipping participants.

Echelon III officials, participants of level III education and leadership training play a very decisive role in setting program policies and leading change in the improvement and implementation of program policies that have been made.

However, in the implementation process, they cannot do it alone. The participants of level III education and leadership training, as happens in their real leadership, need mentors and stakeholders who are able to support them. Participants also need a coach who is able to provide academic direction, encouragement, support and motivation in order for the expected changes to be realized successfully.

Based on the Regulation of the Head of State Administrative Agency No. 19 of 2015, it is stated that education and leadership training for officials who will and/or have occupied the structural positions of echelon III in all ministries, institutions, and local governments are intended to form a bureaucratic leader who has a high ability in describing the vision and mission of agencies into agency programs and leading their implementation.

The purpose of human resource development is to improve the technical, theoretical, conceptual, and moral capabilities of employees so that their work performance is good and can achieve optimal results. From this understanding, it is clear that education and training are also intended to reduce the level of error, because the level of mistakes made by an employee in carrying out the work will be reduced if he mastered the technical, theoretical and conceptual skills needed to carry out the work (Hasibuan, 1997).

Although it is realized that there is no way that there is a civil apparatus of the state that has never done anything wrong in carrying out its daily duties, it should be by following the education and leadership training can train the sensitivity and thoroughness of an employee in carrying out his work so as to reduce the minimum level of error in carrying out the work. In addition, not all errors can be considered commonplace. Especially for jobs that are directly related to public services and work related to financial management, of course it takes a high level of thoroughness should be avoided the occurrence of mistakes.

The fault of an employee in carrying out the task, which will feel very directly the consequences is the user. If the work is internal organization, then the most able to feel it is the direct supervisor of the employee concerned. Mistakes like this can usually be resolved immediately and resolved because it depends only on the boss and subordinate. But it would be different if mistakes in the work were directly related to public services.

Mistakes like this, if done too often will result in a bad image of the organization especially concerning public services. For public organizations such as local governments, usually the community will easily directly follow the low quality of local government performance. This is what is expected to be avoided by education and training, including education and leadership training level III.

Efforts to improve the human resources of the state civil apparatus through education and training is a form of real effort in managing the performance of the state civil apparatus. Performance management is a strategic and integrated approach to achieving continued success in the organization by improving the performance of employees working on it and by developing the capabilities of teams and individual contributors (Armstrong and Baron, 1998).

Performance management as it relates to the approach of creating a shared vision of the goals and objectives of the organization, helping to understand employees, and getting to know their part in contributing, and in doing so, managing, and improving the performance of both individuals and organizations (Fletcher, 2001).

The above theory is in accordance with the education strategy and leadership training level III in the development of the performance of the state civil apparatus of the North Hulu Sungai Regency Government that the performance of an organization will depend heavily on the performance of its employees.

Strategy can be defined as a formulation of the mission and objectives of the organization, including an action plan to achieve that goal by explicitly considering the conditions of competition and the influences of forces outside the organization that directly or indirectly affect the continuity of the organization (Anthony, Parrewe and Kacmar, 1999).

Thus, the quality of the work of an apparatus will always get the spotlight, both from direct users and people who do not directly see the performance of an apparatus because as a public organization the performance of local government will have an impact on public services.

Therefore, to know the impact of an education and training, it is necessary to evaluate the work of an employee. Idea the assessment of an employee's work is seen from before attending education and training and after attending education and training, because assuming on the improvement of ability means there should be a change in the direction of better and for this there should be a comparison.

Education strategy and leadership training level III in improving the quality of performance of the state civil apparatus Of North Hulu Sungai Regency government is planned in accordance with management principles. Management is a typical process, consisting of actions: planning, organizing, mobilizing and supervision, which are carried out to determine and achieve the goals that have been set through the utilization of human resources and other resources. Management is a science or an art (Terry, 1992).

The strength of strategy management is to prepare the capabilities of the organization's human resources in order to achieve the targets that have been set, in this case is the improvement of the competence of the state civil apparatus in carrying out the duties of service to the community and strengthening strong government organizations with the support of qualified human resources.

Employee performance is a function of the interaction between ability and motivation. Whether or not the performance of employees has been achieved by the organization will be influenced by the level of performance of individual and group employees. Performance is the result of work achieved by a person based on the requirements of the work. A job has certain requirements to be able to do in achieving the goal also referred to as the standard of work. Performance standards are the expected level of a particular work to be completed, and are benchmarks for goals or targets to be achieved (pearche Dan Robinson, 2008).

Reliable state civil apparatus is a valuable investment in central and local government agencies. Therefore, the ability and professionalism of the state civil apparatus need to be improved in order to achieve the vision and mission of the government. The improvement of the capabilities and professionalism of the state civil apparatus can be done with the development of apparatus resources. The development of apparatus resources among the bureaucracy has been realized as something very important to realize the achievement of professional government conditions in good governance. In order to improve and develop the quality of the government apparatus, one of the important efforts that must be made is through education and training.

As it is understood in general that the education and training of state civil apparatus, aims to improve the competence of the state civil apparatus in accordance with its field of duty. This is in

accordance with the conception contained in Government Regulation No. 101 of 2000 concerning Education and Training of Civil Servant Departments, that the orientation of education and training of state civil apparatus is on competency development. This conception demands that the ultimate goal of education and training is the improvement of the competence of the state civil apparatus, both managerial competence, technical competence and sociocultural competence. One type of education and training that is the focus of the development of the state civil apparatus is education and leadership training.

Education and leadership training are expected to improve the performance of individuals and institutions. Alumni are expected to be able to show improved performance by implementing knowledge gained during education and training tailored to the conditions of alumni institutions. In addition, another competency that is expected is the emergence of adaptive leadership competencies. Leaders are expected to be able to mobilize existing resources to achieve organizational goals. This competency is also expected to improve the ability of leaders to build and encourage innovation in their agencies.

The above competencies are the target of the implementation of the agency. However, these achievements are not easily realized given the challenges and obstacles, both internal and external. For example, alumni performance is strongly influenced by individual motivations and institutional conditions. The condition of alumni leaders can also directly affect alumni performance. Budget availability is also an obstacle that is often encountered in the achievement of the performance of individuals and institutions.

In addition to performance, other outputs in the implementation of education and training is the emergence of change projects in the form of innovations while at the outcome level, alumni are expected to be able to encourage innovative culture in institutions by being able to build innovations in accordance with the needs and capacities of the institution. In addition, the innovation is also expected to improve the quality of service both from the quality and quantity of service. However, innovations that are built to often face obstacles. Some innovations are unable to achieve medium and long-term targets. In fact, some innovations are no longer used or stopped.

The current Level III leadership education and training pattern introduce the term mentor and coach. The mentor is a direct supervisor/person appointed by the institution of staffing supervisor participants to carry out the role and function of the mentor. Meanwhile, the coach is a change project supervisor appointed by the educational and leadership training organization. Both are necessary to assist participants in determining the area of change to be made and to support the changes that will be chosen by the participants.

The planning and implementation of this change project is an effort to internalize the material received during the education and leadership training as well as the realization of the final objectives of the education curriculum and leadership training level III. Therefore, it is necessary to understand by the participants that the designed change project must:

- a. Has a strong association with the materials provided during the learning in accordance with the condition of the problem to be reformed by participants in their organization;

- b. Change projects have a high strategic value, especially in implementing innovative change programs that will be implemented in the scope of Echelon III units;
- c. Build organizational learning with stakeholders by communicating perceived organizational problems, observed and identified systematically;
- d. Build communication between participants and mentors to have the same perception and understanding so that participants get approval to make reforms related to the problems faced in the work unit, as well as implement the planned change project, furthermore;
- e. Pour the draft idea of the change area and the implementation of the change area of the proposal document and report on the implementation of the change project.

The new pattern of education and leadership training is one of the newest breakthroughs in the world of education and leadership training, where this phase must be passed by every civil apparatus of the country that will sit in the office. Everything new always feels bad, stiff, hard, and so on. But if we have tried and run it, then slowly will become accustomed, and when it is used then something heavy will become light and the difficulty will be easy. Therefore, moving forward and safely carrying out education and leadership training with a new pattern, hopefully it is expected to give birth to future change leaders.

Education and training as a means to improve the quality of apparatus resources is more important than increasing the number of employees. With regard to the above, Thoha (2005) said that government apparatus resources are the most important asset for a government in organizing its performance. On the other hand, apparatus resources are the biggest obstacle in the implementation of development caused by the relatively low ability of the government apparatus. Increasing authority and the task of local governments to manage and develop regional resources and take care of their households, then this should be the right momentum for local governments to improve themselves. From this statement, it can be interpreted that with the increasing authority and duties of the local government, the ability of apparatus resources needs to be improved.

Thus the improvement of the quality of apparatus resources in order to carry out such a large authority is more important than the increase in quantity. The same thing was also conveyed by Rasyid (1998) who said that the essence of regional autonomy is the performance of apparatus resources because it will mobilize and direct employees in achieving organizational goals.

In other words, the realization of the mission of the organization can fail if it is not supported by quality government performance. This can be obtained from cadres who are well prepared through regular education and training, and forged through long field experience. From this statement it can also be concluded that the improvement in order to implement more necessary regional autonomy is the improvement of the quality of apparatus resources in order to improve their performance.

One of the important efforts in order to improve the quality of personnel resources is through education and training, and also needs to be supported by long field experience. Therefore, what must be really considered is how to best manage the resources of such a large apparatus so as not

to become a new burden for the implementation of the main tasks and functions of the local government.

In relation to the development of apparatus resources, in the Upper North River has also been implemented various types of education and training. These types of education and training include pre-service education and training, leadership education and training, technical education and training, and functional education and training.

From a theoretical perspective, the implementation of apparatus resource development through education and training is a must. Various expert opinions, that generally say that the essence of the development of apparatus resources is education and training (Notoatmodjo, 1998); Effendi (1992).

In Hulu Sungai Utara Regency itself, the implementation of education and training that is manifestly managed by the Pndidikan and Patihan Staffing Agency of North Hulu Sungai Regency is education and pre-service training of groups I and II as well as education and leadership training level IV, but the last education and leadership training level IV and III implemented by the Provincial Government through the Human Resources Mining Agency of South Kalimantan Province.

Identifying the need for training and development there are three parties involved. The three parties are the organizational unit that manages human resources, the managers of various work units, and the employees concerned. In this statement contained the meaning that in order for the implementation of training can achieve the expected goals, the identification of the need for training for each agency is very important to be done (Siagian, 2003).

That there is no involvement of the employee concerned in the process of identifying the need for education and training. This involvement is actually necessary so that an employee's participation in an educational and training activity is really on the awareness of the employee concerned to improve his/her ability to carry out the work.

It should be the starting point to give an employee the opportunity to participate in education and training programs is that the employee is intellectually mature so that he/she knows the weaknesses that still exist in him that must be improved through education and training programs.

The involvement of managers from various task forces, in this case the agency leaders in the government ranks of North Hulu Sungai Regency, in identifying the needs of education and leadership training level III is also limited to providing information about the number of employees in the task force who have been and who have not attended education and leadership training.

The involvement of managers in identifying educational and training needs is in terms of what kind of education and training the state civil apparatus needs. For education and technical training and education and functional training is theoretically appropriate because based on the information of participants, the identification of educational and training needs is carried out based on predictive techniques submitted by each agency leader in the government ranks of

North Hulu Sungai Regency, and the Government of North Hulu Sungai Regency in this case the Education and Training Staffing Agency of North Hulu Sungai Regency is only limited to proposing participants who will follow the education and leadership training III conducted at the Provincial Human Resources Development Agency. South Kalimantan (Siagian, 2003).

From the process of implementing education and leadership training III organized by the Human Resources Development Agency of South Kalimantan Province in accordance with his opinion Bernardin & Russell in Gomes, (2006) mentioned three stages in the training program, namely:

- a. Assessment of training needs whose purpose is to gather information to determine whether or not a training program is needed;
- b. The development of the training program, aims to design the training environment and training methods needed to achieve the training objectives;
- c. Evaluation of training programs that have the aim to test and assess whether the training programs that have been undergone, effectively able to achieve the set goals.

In relation to improving the competence of the state civil apparatus through education and training programs, Government Regulation No. 101 of 2000 Education and Training of Civil Servant Department explained that education and training of civil servants are a teaching and learning process aimed at improving the capabilities of the state civil apparatus.

In addition, Law No. 5 of 2015 on State Civil Apparatus also mandates that every state civil apparatus is entitled to the development of employee competencies based on qualifications, competencies, performance assessments, and agency needs. The types of competencies mentioned in the law are technical competencies, managerial competencies, and sociocultural competencies.

Education and leadership training apply classical and non-classical learning patterns. At the time of classical learning, participants experienced a series of learning experiences in the training, organizing agencies, namely by reading, training materials, hear lectures from various experts, discuss with experts and fellow participants about strategic issues and issues relevant to the subject matter, simulation, watch short films relevant to the subject matter, discuss cases, visit places that can help internalize learning outcomes, identify best practices managing organizational policies, adopt and/or adapt best practice in the form of lesson learn, test educational and training materials, get guidance, and present change projects.

During non-classical learning, participants gains learning experience in their workplace mentoring, setting areas of change, implementing designs and documenting the results of implementation of change projects that are defined as leading changes in the workplace. During non-classical learning participants perform their duties again in accordance with their positions and the rights and obligations of participants are restored in accordance with the prevailing laws and regulations.

The State civil apparatus should be able to create work productivity to achieve public services that lead to good governance and clean governance. Improving the quality of service can be achieved by recognizing the conditions and challenges faced. Solving organizational problems can be achieved by the principle of accountability and innovation.

The organization's unclear and often multidimensional mission makes the performance of public organizations difficult to measure. Based on the main purpose of a public organization is to serve the needs of the public. So the performance of public organizations will look very simple because it only serves those needs. However, in reality it is very difficult to measure the performance of public organizations because there has not been an agreement on the measure of performance of public organizations. So far, what is often held is the standard of service.

Then to see the impact after the existence of education and training, researchers looked in terms of the consequences of participants consisting of 2 kinds of functional and dysfunctional consequences. Where in these consequences there is a Gap that occurs. Beginning after the completion of education and training the participants are able and apply what has been given at the time of education and training.

But gradually the reality of their return to its origin is the lack of work spirit, and indiscipline occurs in alumni participants of education and leadership training III. In addition, the gap that occurs is the application of materials that are done after returning to their agencies, where they only apply according to the duties and functions, while the knowledge they get is used as additional knowledge and will be useful when they are mutated.

Participants of education and leadership training can be evaluated on their ability to get promoted to higher levels of position and the ability to apply the knowledge gained during education and training. Participants mentioned that participants who attended education and training had different backgrounds such as age factors, class rank, work experience and basic education. Thus making it difficult and hindering the implementation of education and training because their capture, perception, and reasoning power to the lessons given are not the same (Hasibuan, 2005).

5. Conclusion

Education strategy and leadership training level III in improving the quality of the performance of the state civil apparatus of the Government of North Hulu Sungai Regency implemented by the Regional Human Resources Development Agency of South Kalimantan Province has been implemented based on various applicable regulations, but there is still a discrepancy between the expected objectives of education and leadership training level III with the follow-up placement of both promotion and career improvement of the country's civil apparatus.

Reference

- Shannon, D. (2019). A Tale of a Discursive Shift: Analysing EU Policy Discourses in Irish Adult Education Policy – From the White Paper to the Further Education and Training Strategy. *The Irish Journal of Adult and Community Education*.
- Septiani, V., & Cahyono, D. (2019). Education and training strategy in Palembang aviation college. *International Journal of Recent Technology and Engineering*. <https://doi.org/10.35940/ijrte.C6561.098319>
- Nawawi, H. Murni Martini, (1996). *Penelitian Terapan*, Yogyakarta: Gajah Mada University.

- Moleong, Lexy J. (2017). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif*, cetakan ke-36, Bandung: PT. Remaja Rosdakarya
- Mulyana, Deddy. (2006). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif*, Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Creswell, JW. (1998). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design Choosing Among Five Traditions*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Milles, M.B. and Huberman, M.A. (1984). *Qualitative Data Analysis*. London: Sage Publication
- Hasibuan S.P. Malayu, (1997). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*, Jakarta: Gunung Agung.
- Amstrong, M & Baron, A. (1998). *Performance Management Hand Book*. London: IPM.
- fletcher, C. (2001). *Performance Appraisal and Management*. Journal of Occupational and Organizational Psychology, Vol 74, Issues 4, pp. 473-487
- Anthony, W.P., Parrewe, P.L. dan Kacmar, K. M. (1999). *Strategic Human Resources Management*. Second Edition, Orlando: Harcourt Brace and Company.
- Terry, George R Leslie W Rue, 1992. *Dasar-dasar Manajemen*, Jakarta : PT Bumi Aksara.
- Pearche, J.A dan Robinson, R.B.Jr. (2008). *Management strategies 10*. Salemba Empat: Jakarta.
- Thoha, M. 2005. *Perilaku Organisasi Konsep Dasar dan Aplikasinya*. Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada
- Rasyid, Ryaas, (1998). *Makna Pemerintahan: Tinjauan Dari Segi Etika dan. Kepemimpinan*. Jakarta : Yarif Watampone
- Notoatmodjo, S. (1998). *Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia, Rineka Cipta, Jakarta*
- Siagian, Sondang P, (2003). *Administrasi Pembangunan*, Jakarta: Gedung Agung.
- Bernardin & Russel. (2006). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Diterjemahkan oleh. Bambang Sukoco. Bandung: Armico.
- Hasibuan, S.P Malayu (2005). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Edisi Revisi. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.